

**Dennis Murray called the meeting to order** at 5 p.m. after a moment of silence offered for the fire fighters killed in Toledo, Ohio during the weekend, the **Invocation**, given by Julie Farrar, and the **Pledge of Allegiance**.

The clerk called **the roll** and the following Commissioners responded: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady & Julie Farrar.

**City staff present:** Paul Ricci – Fire Chief, John Orzech – Police Chief, Aaron Klein – City Engineer, Rebecca Corrigan – Chief Planner, Anna Enderle – Assistant Planner, Don Rumbutis – IT, Don Icsman - Law Director, Hank Solowiej - Finance Director, Nicole Ard – City Manager and Kelly Kresser - Commission Clerk.

**Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Julie Farrar, the commission voted to excuse Keith Grohe.**

*Discussion:* Dennis Murray said Keith Grohe is getting better and he hopes to join the rest of the commissioners very soon.

**The President declared the motion passed.**

**Upon motion of Julie Farrar and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to approve the minutes of the January 13 and January 16 city commission meetings and suspend the oral reading. The President declared the motion passed.**

Dennis Murray said the commission completed a **tour of the city building** today to see what some of the structural issues are and to identify energy inefficiencies. The tour was given by the city's Building Official, George Poulos, and estimates for rehabilitation have been provided which are about one year old amounting to \$6 - \$7 million which the city does not have; George Poulos said this estimate was \$6.5 million. George Poulos said the idea with the budget presented is for a \$2.4 - \$2.8 million expansion of the municipal court which would require bringing city hall up to code (energy, heating and ventilating, and thermal dynamics of the building). This facility could be piecemealed with a manageable amount of funds - \$750,000 to \$1 million - which, all together, totals \$6.5 million. This would still leave us with 8,000 S.F. – 12,000 SF more than necessary. George Poulos said he also looked at building a new facility for comparison purposes and the estimate to relocate was \$500,000 less. This takes purchasing land into consideration. Dennis Murray said the city does not have the money right now (\$6.2 or \$6.8 million) and this is not entirely an academic point, but he believes George Poulos previously made a recommendation to **not** renovate this building. George Poulos said if the city were to spend this kind of money, it would end up with a new facility but old bones, antiquated and circuitous, and this did not make sense. George Poulos said he recently assisted Perkins Township with building a new facility and the cost was \$170/SF and renovating would be three to five times this cost. Dick Brady said renovating is full of surprises and the moment a decision is made to renovate an old building, budget numbers increase and this horrible realization is often realized way too late. Contracts guarantee maximum prices for a lot of reasons and building new is much more palatable than renovating a facility such as city hall. This is what should lead the city in a certain direction when and if it can. George Poulos said the city has been attempting to salvage the generator system in the building. Wesley Poole said it is early to make any decision and accepts the general statements made, but said George Poulos mentioned replacing a generator which is not the same concept as having a new building and he will need more detail and time to ask some serious questions.

Derek S. Merrin, Northwest Ohio Regional Liaison for Ohio Auditor of State Dave Yost, presented the **Auditor of State Award with Distinction** to Finance Director Hank Solowiej for FY 2012. Derek Merrin said this award is for a select group including about three percent of all entities audited by the State of Ohio. To be eligible for this award, the city must complete and submit a Certified Annual Financial Report, must have a clean audit with no findings for recovery, material citations, material weaknesses, significant deficiencies, findings or other

questioned costs/findings. This award is for all staff members, and especially the Finance Director who works toward financial accountability and is a mark of excellence. Hank Solowiej graciously accepted the award, on the city's behalf, and thanked the commissioners, the members of the Audit/Finance Committee, Don Icsman and the department heads for all of their help. This is a great group of employees and this is an honor. Dick Brady said he is fortunate to be the liaison to the Audit/Finance Committee. This award is representative of how the Finance Director operates and Hank Solowiej is the face of the members of this committee and the staff members in the Finance Department. The commission and administrators do not send enough "atta-boys" to the persons doing the hard work every day and this is an opportunity to do so for the fine people who put in lots of hours doing tedious tasks. Dennis Murray thanked Hank Solowiej for the work he does and said the CAFR is an amazing document with many facets and noted these are online for many years back for comparison purposes. The people of the city can rest assured the numbers are indeed what is shown in the reports.

### **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION** *(agenda items only)*

Bill Criscione, 2207 Quail Hollow Circle, said his family owns Ghostly Manor and are planning the second annual **Lake Erie Zombie Run** utilizing the former Sandusky Drive-In parking lot on Cleveland Road. This property is owned by the City of Sandusky, but the zoning falls under Huron Township. The City of Huron allowed this to happen in 2013 even though the property was zoned residential. Bill Criscione asked the City of Sandusky to consider allowing use of this property for the 2014 event for parking and registration tents. Dennis Murray said he believes this is part of the City Manager's report and the commission will get to this issue, although he believes this arrangement will be fine on a year-to-year basis.

### **PRESENTATIONS**

Dennis Burns, Project Manager & Regional Vice President for Kimley-Horn & Associates, presented the draft results of the **Parking Supply/Demand Study and Parking Management Plan** prepared for the City of Sandusky and the Sandusky Main Street Association. A lot of work went into this report and much was learned at various stakeholder meetings. This was a partnership between the City of Sandusky and the Sandusky Main Street Association to provide an objective assessment of parking issues with focus on creating a parking management plan. The study area involved eighteen blocks in the heart of downtown and Dennis Burns provided a list of different cities where these have been done which have been successful. The supply and demand assessment data contains the average utilization by block and at the peak, sixty one percent of the parking spaces were occupied. The bottom line is there is excess capacity as the average demand was 38% with 1,024 spaces available. It is important to note all of the available spaces. Excess parking is available for potential development projects but may not meet demand in the concentration area(s). Fifteen potential development projects were identified and if all of these were to happen, it would change the parking equation in the downtown area but there is not a policy about providing parking. If larger development projects come up in the future, additional spaces will be required within walking distance. One of the benefits of a new focus on parking is how to address future needs based on development(s). The immediate need is to develop a parking management plan for promoting the economic development of the community in a positive way. This will help document and track policies and procedures in coordination with the city's planner and to coordinate public and private assets involving parking.

Dennis Burns said three options were provided for short-term enhancements:

- Option 1)** reconfiguration of the Jackson Street Pier;
- Option 2)** reconfiguration of the Jackson Street parking lot; and
- Option 3)** additional parking, on a temporary basis, at the Keller Building site.

Parking on the Jackson Street Pier could potentially be reconfigured from its current north-to-south pattern adding a couple of cut-throughs to add 93 spaces to the Pier (248 to 341). Option 2 would include restriping and repaving the parking lot with 175 available parking spaces. It would be important to speak to staff at the State Theatre prior to finalizing any option to learn their loading/unloading needs. If the Keller building is to be demolished, perhaps this space could be utilized as/for temporary parking in the short-term. This would provide a better option for use of the area, especially for vehicles which may need to be parked for a weekend. The city could also charge for these spaces as other cities do. The parking management plan is the heart of the study and a lot of best practices are built from several years of working in municipal environments. Some of the items identified can be the immediate focus but ultimately, it is good to think about all of those listed. A vision and mission statement was drafted to help create a customer-oriented parking system and make it a positive asset. Parking can do a lot for development programs and the city should consider how they align with larger community values. The ten guiding principle categories are:

1. Organization/Leadership
2. Community and Economic Development
3. Leveraging Technology
4. Planning /Urban Design
5. Effective Management/Accountability
6. Customer Service Orientation
7. Communications/Branding /Community Education
8. Accountability/Financial Management
9. Integrated Mobility Management
10. Sustainability

Dennis Burns said the guiding principles in the parking management plan lay the framework for progressive development of a parking management strategy. There are primary and secondary option items in the plan; primary action items are the ones which are critical for getting the program off of the ground while the secondary items are best practices. There are some items as simple as opening the parking garage or adding signage to make the downtown easier to navigate. Dennis Burns said he was in Sandusky last year for an event at the State Theatre and went downtown to have dinner first. The on-street parking was all taken and he ended up at the very top level of the parking garage, yet the basement level was closed off. This level could remain open during big events and this may require collaboration with Erie County. There was trash in the stairwell and graffiti which needed to be cleaned up as this leads visitors to form an impression. The parking permit program needs to be reactivated as there are many more residential units. There is an issue with dumpsters in multiple parking spaces downtown. Motorcycle parking spaces are important to look at, based upon demand, as there are only a few near the bump outs on Columbus Avenue. There is inconsistency with parking signage and this need to be consistent and updated.

A required investment is needed to get a program up and running including the basic tools. The most important element of the organizational structure is how it is done. A business improvement district (BID) should be completed and parking should fall under this BID. This has advantages over a normal city department and includes downtown stakeholders. Another option is to hire someone to manage parking. The management and adjudication should be under one department and should not be under a police department. There should be a Parking Advisory Board and the members could be appointed by the mayor and include city staff to keep active engagement of downtown stakeholders. A parking and operational plan should be developed and revenue could be generated and key projects identified. Dennis Burns said a downtown management plan is important to moving forward and creating a BID, focusing on parking, helps put everything else into perspective so there is no disconnect. Managing on-street parking as a valuable and important resource, with time limits, should be reinstated through a parking ambassador program. One example is placing a sticker, along with a quarter, on a vehicle to "provide an extra 15 minutes of parking" rather than issuing a citation, and this is all about the attitude. There should be a focus on communicating with stakeholders and being collaborative in the approach as parking can play a huge part in economic development.

Programs can pay for themselves and are helpful; revenues can be placed into a parking enterprise fund which go toward economic development. The city should establish, implement and communicate patron-focused parking policies and regulations to help support growing fine dining establishments, entertainment venues and tourism economies. The city should develop an overall parking planning program that includes a parking supply/demand baseline assessment, an assessment of potential long-term parking development sites, the creation of a parking lot and structure design guidelines, and the development of a parking specific capital projects list. There is a listing of secondary action items in the draft document and the commission should update data on a regular basis, set benchmarks and a whole range of other suggestions and ideas. Studies from other communities have been provided as Sandusky goes down the path to improve downtown parking.

Dick Brady asked what an acceptable distance is to parking spaces and Dennis Burns said this would be two to three blocks and generally people do not like to use parking structures. Urban planning or design can help to extend these distances.

Lance Warner, 1421 Columbus Avenue, said because there are so many types of parking demand, residents would like a place right in front to unload, not necessarily to stay. There is a new restaurant downtown which has an agreement to utilize the bank's parking lot after hours. There is also tourism parking which is a very different demand and a comprehensive parking plan is needed.

Jeff Smith said it is the role of government to create a good environment for economic development and for investors. The entertainment district was created 8 – 10 years ago and now the city has a parking issue. There are more parking spots than needed, and hopefully this can be taken care of before it becomes our problem. It is the city's responsibility to develop a parking policy and/or plan.

Jeff Krabill, 300 East Water Street, said the city should put together a comprehensive parking plan as recommended. One small change in the Zinc Brasserie relocating from Columbus Avenue to Water Street has changed the parking dynamic in downtown. The kind of decisions about where shopping and dining will be should remind the city it needs an actual plan for the development of downtown.

Dennis Murray said he initially was skeptical of this parking study being done but since reading the draft document and reflecting on it, he sees many things which have been adopted by other cities. The city needs to support future economic development - it needs to be sustained and those who contributed toward funding this report should be thanked.

### **CURRENT BUSINESS**

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to accept all communications. The President declared the motion passed.**

#### **ITEM #1 – Submitted by Anna Enderle, Assistant Planner**

##### **SUBRECIPIENT AGREEMENT WITH COMMUNITY ACTION COMMISSION**

**Budgetary Information:** The City of Sandusky will award the Community Action Commission of Erie, Huron and Richland Counties, Inc. (CACEHR) \$100,000 to provide emergency home repairs and accessibility modifications to low- and moderate income single-family homeowners in Sandusky under the rules and regulations of the Community Development Block Grant program. The maximum assistance is \$7,999 per household. CACEHR is providing \$31,716 from other local and government program funding sources. There is no impact to the city's general fund.

**ORDINANCE NO. 14-004:** It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a subrecipient agreement with the Community Action Commission of Erie, Huron and Richland Counties, Inc., and to expend an amount not to exceed \$100,000 from the FY 2013 Community Development Block Grant funds;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Wesley Poole, the commission voted to approve this ordinance.**

*Discussion:* Jeff Smith asked when this will be ready and Anna Enderle said the CAC accepts applications all of the time and this is set up as a reimbursement program; the city is invoiced by the CAC after the funds have been expended. Dennis Murray said because of the importance of getting this work done and authorizing it to move forward, it is requested for passage under Section 14 and he is fine with this.

Dennis Murray encouraged the staff **to treat items as ordinary legislation whenever possible** as it is important for the public trust, although this item is appropriate for Section 14.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the ordinance passed.**

**ITEM #2 – Submitted by Victoria Kurt, Recreation Program Supervisor  
SUBMISSION OF GRANT APPLICATIONS FOR RECREATION PROGRAMS**

**Budgetary Information:** There is no budgetary impact. These grants require no matching funds from the city and will be used as partial funding for the costs of the projects. If grants are denied, the Take the Kids Fishing event and summer playground program will still occur, but will cause downsizing of activities, equipment and supplies in order to fit the Recreation Department's budget.

**RESOLUTION NO. 002-14R:** It is requested a resolution be passed **approving the submission of grant applications to the Sandusky/Erie County Community Foundation and the Wightman Wieber Foundation for the Recreation Department and, if awarded, authorizing the city manager to execute any required agreements;** and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Julie Farrar and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to approve this resolution.**

*Discussion:* Julie Farrar said Victoria Kurt noted the February 1 and March 1 deadlines were an issue with this legislation, and Section 14 is appropriate for passage.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. Roll call on the resolution: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the resolution passed.**

**ITEM #3 – Submitted by Victoria Kurt, Recreation Program Supervisor  
LEASE AGREEMENT FOR DORN COMMUNITY PARK CONCESSION AREA**

**Budgetary Information:** The agreement will not result in any additional budgetary expenses. The city will benefit from the agreed upon rental fee income of \$70 per month and electric service reimbursement of \$30 per month.

**ORDINANCE NO. 14-005:** It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a lease agreement with Connie Weyer d.b.a. Ma Da & Dewey for the Dorn Community Park concession area beginning March 15, 2014 through August 15, 2014;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Wesley Poole and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to approve this ordinance.**

*Discussion:* Dennis Murray said he does not believe this should be passed as emergency legislation as there is time before the park opens; it should be treated as ordinary legislation.

Wesley Poole said whether passing this now or later, the staff has performed the work and if it were open for discussion or change someone would have already asked for it to be resubmitted. He does not believe the city gains anything by making the vendor wait another two weeks and wondering whether or not the city is going to honor this. The Charter section exists for a reason (for immediate passage) and if the city were in violation of the law, the Law Director would have said something about it.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 5. Nays: Dennis Murray, 1. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the ordinance passed.**

**ITEM #4 – Submitted by Aaron M. Klein, P.E.**

**STATE ROUTE 2 PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE PROJECT**

**Budgetary Information:** This work will take place at no cost to the city.

**RESOLUTION NO. 003-014R:** It is requested a resolution be passed adopting the consent legislation submitted by the Director of the Ohio Department of Transportation for the preventative maintenance project on State Route 2, PID #79851, ERI SR 0002 00.14PM; authorizing and directing the city manager to sign the consent legislation and to execute any necessary contracts with the Director of Transportation to complete the project; and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Julie Farrar, the commission voted to approve this resolution.**

*Discussion:* Dick Brady asked Aaron Klein to provide an overview of this item as it is more of a courtesy and will not cost the city anything unless we ask for work to be performed. Aaron Klein said one mile of this project is within Sandusky's corporation limits and ODOT is extending a courtesy for the city to approve work being done and they plan to micro-surface the road to reduce hydroplaning and to increase traction. The project extends east and west outside of the city limits on State Route 2, and this will be funded one hundred percent by ODOT.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. Roll call on the resolution: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the resolution passed.**

**ITEM #5 – Submitted by Aaron M. Klein, P.E.**

**ENCROACHMENT LICENSE WITH SANDUSKY RENAISSANCE PROPERTIES, LLC - 215 EAST WATER STREET**

**Budgetary Information:** There is no budgetary impact with this item.

**ORDINANCE NO. 14-006:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing the city manager to enter into a license agreement with Sandusky Renaissance Properties, LLC to provide for the use of a certain portion of the city's rights-of-way as described in the grant of a license for encroachment, a copy of which is attached to this ordinance, marked Exhibit "1" and incorporated herein; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Dick Brady, the commission voted to approve this ordinance.**

*Discussion:* Dennis Murray said he will abstain from voting on this item as one of his partners represents one of the parties involved. Dick Brady said he does not want it to appear the city is giving preferential treatment to a private developer. Aaron Klein said on the Water Street side of this property, the right-of-way is in the face of the property line and this license agreement is necessary. The existing stoop is 9" from the face of the building toward the door and it will extend an extra 45" past the front of the building.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 5. Abstain: Dennis Murray, 1. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 5. Abstain: Dennis Murray, 1. The President declared the ordinance passed.**

**ITEM #6 – Submitted by Aaron M. Klein, P.E.**

**SUBMERGED LANDS LEASE FOR CURRAN STREET**

**Budgetary Information:** The city will be required to pay \$1 each year to the Ohio Department of Natural Resources to maintain this lease.

**PASSED FIRST READING:** It is requested a resolution be adopted pursuant to Section 1506.11 of the Ohio Revised Code finding and determining that based upon the representations and application filed by the City of Sandusky, the use and development of the territory so described, a submerged lands lease may be entered into by the State's Director of Natural Resources.

Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Wesley Poole, the commission voted to approve this resolution. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. Roll call on the resolution: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the resolution passed at first reading.

**ITEM #7– Submitted by Aaron M. Klein, P.E.**

**MOA WITH ERIE SOIL & WATER CONSERVATION DISTRICT FOR 2014 NPDES PHASE II**

**Budgetary Information:** The annual amount for continuing to participate with the Erie County National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Phase II program is \$10,000. The annual cost will be paid with sewer funds.

**ORDINANCE NO. 14-007:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a Memorandum of Agreement with the Erie Soil & Water Conservation District for participation in the Erie County National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System Phase II program; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Julie Farrar and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to approve this ordinance.

*Discussion:* Jeff Smith said this is a small investment to make for a clean lake and bay for the tourists who visit our city and for the residents of Sandusky and Erie County.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the ordinance passed.**

**ITEM #8 – Submitted by Jane E. Cullen, P.E.**

**RESOLUTION OF NECESSITY FOR CAMP STREET UNDERPASS REHABILITATION PROJECT**

**Budgetary Information:** The engineer's estimate for the total project cost including engineering, inspection, testing, advertising and miscellaneous expenses are \$1,959,652.41. ODOT will fund 80% of the eligible costs in the amount of \$1,551,085.90. The city's 20% share of the eligible costs will be funded by the sewer fund in the amount of \$133,295.80 and the capital fund in the amount of \$254,475.68. The remaining costs are 100% the city's responsibility in the amount of \$20,795.03 and will be paid with Community Development Block Grant funds.

**RESOLUTION NO. 004-14R:** It is requested a resolution be passed declaring the necessity for the city to proceed with the proposed Camp Street underpass rehabilitation project; approving the specifications and engineer's estimate of cost thereof; and directing the city manager to advertise for and receive bids in relation thereto; and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to approve this resolution.**

*Discussion:* Aaron Klein said this project is almost identical to the Hayes Avenue underpass project and similar to the Columbus Avenue underpass project from several years ago. The retaining walls and drainage will be redone, there will be a new lift station for sewer and water and the entire underpass will be redone including recoating the steel on the railroad bridge and redoing the sidewalks/walking surface. Dennis Murray said he is glad Aaron Klein is here to do the engineering work for the city, he enjoys working with him and is glad he is overseeing the project. Julie Farrar asked about the lighting and noted it will also be improved.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. Roll call on the resolution: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the resolution passed.**

#### **ITEM #9 – Submitted by Donald Rumbutis, IT Tech**

##### **AGREEMENT WITH ASSUREVAULT FOR BACKUP AND DISASTER RECOVERY SOLUTION**

**Budgetary Information:** The initial cost is \$8,200 and then there is a monthly cost of approximately \$1,300. The monthly cost is based on 2,000 GB of user storage (or 1,300 GB of compressed storage) at the rate of \$1 per compressed GB. The monthly cost will fluctuate, as it is determined by the actual amount of data used in off-site storage. The cost would be allocated to the general fund (50% of cost), water fund (25% of cost) and sewer fund (25% of cost).

**ORDINANCE NO. 14-008:** It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a three year agreement with AssureVault of Chesterland, Ohio, for services to provide a backup and disaster recovery system;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to approve this ordinance.**

*Discussion:* Dick Brady asked what is being used now and Don Rumbutis said our current equipment is outdated and barely functional. Nicole Ard said this item has been addressed in our audits.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the ordinance passed.**

#### **CITY MANAGER'S REPORT**

**Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Julie Farrar, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$400 from George Mylander. The President declared the motion passed.**

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$50 from Richard Feix for the Green Fund. The President declared the motion passed.**

Nicole Ard said the City of Sandusky received an invoice for its **2013 membership in the Sandusky Main Street Association (SMA) in the amount of \$250.** In meetings with different executives, the city is asked to contribute and Nicole Ard asked the commission what they wish to do. Sometime mid-year 2014, the SMA will request payment for the next years' membership. Nicole Ard said the city has been a member of the SMA for a number of years and the commission has approved this, similar to our membership in the Erie County Chamber of

Commerce. Dick Brady asked if Nicole Ard represents the City of Sandusky at these meetings and Nicole Ard said she attends them; previously Todd Roth, the City Engineer, attended meetings. Nicole Ard said she is not a voting member of the SMA. Last summer, the SMA conducted a fundraising campaign to sustain the organization and this payment would be for the city's membership.

Nicole Ard said several staff members went to a meeting regarding **high speed rail** and a Memorandum of Understanding will be presented at a later date to promote improvements to the system and to our stations. Staff in engineering will be scheduling a meeting with the Erie Regional Planning office regarding our participation with **All Aboard Ohio**.

Nicole Ard said a memorandum was distributed regarding the **board and commission appointments made by the city manager and affirmed by the city commission** as follows:

<b>BOARD/COMMISSION</b>	<b>STATUS</b>	<b>NEW TERM EXPIRATION</b>
<u>Fire Prevention Code Board of Appeals</u>		
John Feick	Reappointment	1.1.19
Dan Shepherd	Reappointment	1.1.19
<u>Erie County Board of Health</u>		
Thelma Darden	Reappointment	12.31.18
<u>Housing Appeals Board</u>		
Walt Matthews	Reappointment	12.31.16
<u>Plumber Examining Board</u>		
Mark Dunn	Reappointment	12.31.14
John Luipold	Reappointment	12.31.14
John Zoellner	Reappointment	12.31.14
Dave Swander	Reappointment	12.31.14
<u>Residential Building Code Board of Appeals</u>		
Tom Bartles (Alternate)	Reappointment	12.31.18
Dan Fresch (Alternate)	Reappointment	12.31.18
Richard Hohler (Alternate)	Reappointment	12.31.18
Roger Gundlach	Reappointment	12.31.18
Paul Prete (Alternate)	Reappointment	12.31.18
Gene Riedy (Alternate)	Reappointment	12.31.18

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to approve the board and commission reappointments as outlined. The President declared the motion passed.**

Nicole Ard said based on the **Audit/Finance Committee meeting** held last Friday, the members requested a ratio of twenty five percent (25%) for the fund balance. This was very helpful in guiding the city for future years and a target percentage. Based on this information and discussions with staff members and union officials, there are things the city may try to do for 2014. Dick Brady said as the liaison to the Audit/Finance Committee, the city is getting very close to dealing with this budget issue, but we are not there yet. He is happy to see the commission develop, at the City Manager's request, a number to take back. Dick Brady asked Hank Solowiej to share information about closing this gap even further. Hank Solowiej said after the meeting Friday, he double checked with the Erie County Auditor about the city's share of Local Government Funds (LGF) and the city had budgeted too low for this in 2014. He would like to revise the estimate for LGF's this year by \$86,000; we had budgeted \$324,000 and the total amount for 2014 should be \$410,000. In order to help close this gap, the commission had talked about eliminating the recycling bins, a parks and recreation subsidy, and contractual services for the economic development account. These items get the city to approximately 24.8% and a spend-down of approximately \$181,000 which is just under the \$200,000 the

commission had talked about. Dick Brady said this amount of a draw down is within an acceptable range and eliminating the recycle bins are a huge piece of this puzzle and perhaps this forces our hand. The city has to be bold enough to say there needs to be another way to reduce our footprint or draw down and the county has provided a piece to this puzzle with other offers for recycling. If the city were running in the black, perhaps we would not take these kinds of measures. Hank Solowiej said the other thing stressed is to look out to 2015 and 2016, and he has started to work on some preliminary general fund revenue projections for these two years while the City Manager and her staff are working on expenses to get a rough idea of where we will be with the current level of staffing. Dick Brady said 2014 may be our easiest year and it will get a lot tougher in 2015 and 2016. We cannot run a city of 25,000 people with less police officers and firefighters than we have currently. Hank Solowiej said this is not the fault of the city and we have lost several revenue sources including local government funds and estate tax. The city relied on these in the past and they are now gone. Dick Brady said we need to decide what kind of city we want: Detroit, Dublin or somewhere in between. Dennis Murray said he thinks the three year lookout is essential and many local governments, school districts and businesses do this, some on a five-year basis. He is worried about 2015 and 2016 and when the city gets around to reviewing its Charter, he would like the commission to consider whether it needs to be modified to deal with budgetary issues. By the time the budget is passed in March, there will still be nine months left in the year and this is important. We have had some great contributions made by the police and fire unions, but there still is the issue of health care costs which needs to be addressed to chip away at this \$181,000. Changes to health care have not been included to this point. Some of these issues may be contentious and at some point a budget will be presented and he will have to work with the charter officers to present something which could then be amended.

Nicole Ard thanked the staff members who assisted during **recent inclement weather** who continued providing outstanding services. The staff in traffic services provided salt to Perkins Township as they had run out; city was able to maintain its own supply. Dennis Murray stated motorists should be aware they can be ticketed if they are parked on an emergency snow street during times when snow exceeds two inches and to observe this regulation.

Nicole Ard congratulated **Anna Enderle - Assistant Planner - who has accepted a position with Ohio City, Inc.** as Physical Development Specialist. This goes along with her background in urban planning and design. Nicole Ard thanked Anna for the work she has done for the City of Sandusky while employed here. Dick Brady asked what steps will be taken to fill this position as it is critical and Nicole Ard said there are different skills sets currently within this office. There said there have been discussions about what can be done in-house by staff and what may be provided by contracting out. The Assistant Planner position was funded with CDBG dollars last year and in the 2014 planning process, planning support and CDBG administrative support may be provided by Rebecca Corrigan - Planner. Nicole Ard said the job description for Assistant Planner is being looked at and research is being done to perhaps provide a Request for Proposals for some of these services. Dick Brady encouraged his support in filling this position. Dennis Murray said this is a terribly important position and there are housing issues he would like to see completed by staff which the city has not been able to address for some time. Julie Farrar said the presentation tonight about downtown parking has an economic development component and it is vital to keep this department staffed and this would be money well spent. Wesley Poole asked what kind of timeline there is to fill this position and Nicole Ard said a list of tasks are being put together and contact is being made with the different consulting firms and it should not be very long. Dennis Murray asked if February 15 is a realistic date and Nicole Ard said she is shooting for February 8.

Nicole Ard congratulated **Mike Delk on his transfer to the Maintenance I position in Water Distribution.** This division has been affected by the weather and many main breaks were experienced this winter.

Nicole Ard thanked **Rebecca Corrigan for filling on the city's behalf at the boat show when we were recognized for the Clean Marina status.** Rebecca was able to get to the boat show while others could not because of inclement weather.

Nicole Ard said the **2014 special events guide** was just published and thanked Merrill Lynch for their sponsorship of this brochure. It is now available online or on paper. Health conscious events were added to the guide this year.

Nicole Ard said the city received a request regarding the **2014 Zombie Mud Run event**. They are interested in a five-year commitment, but Nicole Ard said she recommends proceeding with a commitment for 2014 and year-to-year thereafter. The city should have discussions about our expectations regarding this property (the former drive-in). Dick Brady said the commission is merely putting their blessing on this. Wesley Poole said he does not know the purpose for the five-year commitment. Bill Criscione – organizer of this event - said he has spoken to Erie MetroParks and is fine with planning on a year-to-year basis and the city will speak with Erie MetroParks about this. Wesley Poole said he supports this one-day ongoing event and if the property is needed by someone else for economic development, we will deal with this at that time. Dennis Murray said there does not seem to be opposition to this arrangement.

Dick Brady said he is the **liaison for the engineering department** and included in the City Manager's report is the report from Aaron Klein and his department which is eight pages long. Dick Brady said he has met with Aaron Klein several times during the past several months and in the strongest of terms, **would like to lobby the other commissioners to hire an Assistant Engineer** and asked Nicole Ard if she shared the same idea about this need. Although switching from cutting to adding budgetary numbers, Dick Brady said infrastructure is critically important to this community and is essential for economic development. Dick Brady said he would like this to be a very high priority as he sees the number of projects and feels Aaron is swimming under water. Nicole Ard said she can appreciate this and looking around the room, there are many departments swimming under water. At one point in time there were several engineers on staff as well as other administrative staff members. Nicole Ard said Aaron Klein has asked about having a Project Engineer for water and sewer projects, but she can also make the same case for Community Development. Nicole Ard said she does not know if it is best to contract out for engineering support for projects, as necessary, or to hire a temporary engineering position. Nicole Ard said in the overall scheme, knowing there are people dedicated to economic development and knowing concessions have been made, this is another issue for consideration. Nicole Ard said Aaron Klein had asked about a Chief Foreman and other positions, and there are needs like this in each of the departments including police and fire. It is difficult to prioritize in this manner but having a person with a contract and not being tied to a long-term commitment may provide financial assurance. Dick Brady said when he looks at the book of business for engineering, contracting this service out is not prudent as we would pay a premium to do so. The city has done this in the past with firms such as John Hancock & Associates and having this large of a book of business justifies another Engineer for this department. Dick Brady said we usually only get one chance to do infrastructure right and if it is not done properly for lack of the right person to draw, design and monitor its installation, we will pay a heavy price for this six or seven years down the road (rather than lasting 40 – 70 years). All of the projects in place are one book of business while all of the other projects will follow and are in another book. Dick Brady said he serves as the liaison for the Engineering Department and this is where his passion is but if necessary, he would like to instruct the city manager to advertise for this position. Dennis Murray said he has noted before the City of Sandusky is a conglomeration of issues with a utility side and many projects are well funded by water and sewer. It is not as though he is proposing to hire an Assistant Police Chief as these dollars do not migrate between the utility side as they are two different worlds. Dick Brady said these funds are regulated and are there to update our infrastructure; this is an opportunity to leverage. Wesley Poole said he was previously the liaison to engineering and realizes there is a need for additional assistance, but at this point, there is an entire city with departments that have needs. The City Manager should be instructed to assess all of the departments to decide where employees should be added or subtracted and to look at the entire picture. Wesley Poole said it is not in the best interest to cherry pick this based upon who has the most eloquent presentation by expressing a need. Wesley Poole said he would like to see a current organizational chart reflecting each position and what each does according to their job description as well as to identify what they contribute to the overall goals of the community. Wesley Poole said the commission needs to look at the overall picture rather than picking and

choosing and to determine whether we can utilize interns for some of these jobs. He recognizes help is needed but without an assessment across the board, he is not comfortable saying we are going to hire someone today. Julie Farrar said the public sometimes does not understand the employees in the police and fire departments are paid from the general fund and the Engineer needs help as well as staff members in other departments. This goes back to getting more done and getting the job done, more things happening and more things coming to the city. Julie Farrar said she is not cherry picking, but understands where Dick Brady is coming from; she does not want one department to feel she is supportive over another. When it comes to funding mechanisms, in the long run, this may be a good option to take to get where we need to be with economic development for the city. Dick Brady said he questions the comments about what to do with the 27 ongoing projects. While we wait to develop a master plan or a plan regarding each employee and their role(s), Rome is burned. By this, he means there are projects such as the water line on First Street, the Ferndale Drive project and a host of others. The last sentence in the engineering report is discouraging and states, "lack of time to develop a plan, lack of time to monitor" and this is not isolated to one or two projects, it is all of them which shouts a need. These projects are going to be rolled out and we are going to suffer for a lack of specifications and a lack of detail; the moment you look away is the moment the city will suffer with a very short time to recover. Wesley Poole suggested Aaron Klein has been here for quite some time and has had a lack of help during this entire time. At this point, there is no job description describing what an Assistant Engineer would do or how it will be funded. Wesley Poole said he does not disagree with this, but it is a matter of process. One commissioner should not be able to come in, state there is this need, give a great oratory about it, and decide about hiring. There should be a process for the department head to establish what they want, what the person is going to do, and how it will be funded before consideration is given. Dennis Murray said he thinks a consensus process has been laid out and in order to address the differing concerns, he asked the City Manager to work together to determine how this position gets funded by the next meeting and communicate it to the commissioners via email. Dennis Murray said the commission cannot take action via email, but information can be disseminated in this fashion.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

Dennis Murray said he has had discussion with Don Icsman about **legislation regarding the city's Bicentennial Commission**, and stated the city will be looking for a chairperson for this Commission in the near future.

Dennis Murray said he and Don Icsman have also taken a look at a **charter amendment dealing with changing the size of the commission** and this is in the works, although he is not sure when this will take place.

Dennis Murray announced a series of **Town Hall meetings** regarding the budget and other related items: Thursday, February 13 at 6 p.m. at the Sandusky Library; Saturday, February 15 at 9 a.m. at Mr. Smith's Coffee House; and, Tuesday, February 18 at 6 p.m. at Sandusky High School, Room 300. A press release will be issued and all of these meetings will be hosted by the city commission as a whole and the public is welcome to attend and participate. Department heads and charter officers are welcome but not expected. This is an effort to have conversations with the public and the meetings will be formally noticed. Don Icsman reminded the commission there will not be any decisions made at these meetings and they are for fact-finding and information-gathering purposes. Don Icsman said the issue when previous commissioners held coffee meetings was having meetings where they deliberate or discuss as someone can ask for the minutes because then it is a meeting. Not only would notification be in order, but minutes must be taken and it becomes a real complicated issue. The city has always erred by not having the Clerk at these meetings and one of the previous commissioners prepared meeting minutes so the distinction was maintained for legal purposes. These will not be official meetings and decisions will not be made although opinions could be expressed and the commissioners can talk with the residents; these are information-gathering meetings with constituents and so long as things continue this way, he is fine with them.

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Julie Farrar, the commission voted to appoint Jennifer Yingling to the Human Relations Commission for a term ending October 10, 2016. The President declared the motion passed. *Note: This appointment was never confirmed as Ms. Yingling is not a city resident and the city's Code for the Human Relations Commission requires residency.***

Naomi Twine said another **member of the Human Relations Commission, Jessica Ginty, has not attended the last three meetings and asked Kelly Kresser to solicit applications to fill her seat.**

Naomi Twine said she is **the liaison for the Police Department** and met with Chief John Orzech last week. They had a very good discussion about a lot of things happening in the department and one of the issues is finalizing the creation of a table of organization. John Orzech is also working on a strategic plan for the Police Department and has a volunteer to assist him in working out goals and objectives for the department.

Dennis Murray said a **public hearing needs to be set for the 2014 budget** and asked the Clerk about scheduling this at the next regular meeting; Kelly Kresser said the draft budget needs to be published in the newspaper five days prior to the passage of legislation. Hank Solowiej said he does not know if this can happen as soon as the next commission meeting. Dennis Murray said he does not yet know where the health care piece fits in with the budget. Nicole Ard said the next Audit/Finance Committee is scheduled for February 21 and the members asked to receive additional information before passing the budget. Dennis Murray asked the commission to consider hosting the public hearing on February 24 and then vote on the legislation for the 2014 budget during the same meeting. There being no objection, Dennis Murray announced a **public hearing will take place on Monday, February 24 regarding the 2014 budget.**

Julie Farrar asked if someone needs to **contact Erie County about posting signage at the downtown parking garage and about the graffiti and vandalism** there as discussed during tonight's presentation. Dick Brady said he will make this contact.

Julie Farrar Aaron Klein to provide an **overview of snow plowing and salting efforts** so far this winter season. Aaron Klein said the normal practice for salting is to do the intersections, main roads and downtown areas first. As far as salting, these same areas are salted first and the residential roadways thereafter. Aaron Klein said the Traffic Services Foreman reports it is necessary to have fifteen to sixteen persons over two shifts to do all of the side streets and main roads; currently there are only ten employees in this department and staff from other departments and divisions have been assisting. Salt only works down to nineteen degrees Fahrenheit (19° F); below this temperature, and without sun, there is no point in putting salt on the roadways. Overtime hours thus far this winter season (November 22 to January 15) are at 573 hours which is a significant amount. This includes double time and night time and it is difficult to get the continuous minimum number of employees when there are only ten employees in the department to start with. Employees from the Divisions of Sewer, Water and Horticultural Services have been assisting those in Traffic Services. There have also been a large number of water main breaks and the city is very limited with the staff available. Aaron Klein commended the employees who have been keeping up with this. As far as salt, the city did not run out this past weekend and we lent a couple of loads to Perkins Township. The employees are plowing the best they can and are salting when temperatures are appropriate and in some locations, have utilized sand.

**Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to hold an executive session regarding personnel, City Manager. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the motion passed.**

**Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Julie Farrar, the commission voted to hold an executive session regarding personnel, Law Director. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley**

**Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the motion passed.**

**Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to hold an executive session regarding pending litigation. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Wesley Poole, Naomi Twine, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Julie Farrar, 6. The President declared the motion passed.**

#### **OLD BUSINESS**

Dennis Murray said there was a question posed by Tim Schwanger about **the cost to save the three arches in the Keller Building** if it is indeed demolished. The cost will be \$7,000 each (there are three) and Dennis Murray asked if there is any direction to provide staff about salvaging these to create an arch or some type of decorative area with the stone. The other option is to request or allow the Old House Guild to pick this material out after the building has been taken down. Dennis Murray said he would hope enough could be salvaged to do something with this material as the total to salvage all three is \$21,000 which is a pretty high cost.

#### **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION**

Tim Schwanger, representing Save Our Shoreline Parks, said there are two options to save the arches: pay \$7,000 each or have city crews remove them. Dennis Murray said this is what he understands and is the idea to try to salvage. Tim Schwanger said the idea was thrown out as the Northwest Plaza at the Chesapeake Loft property was approved five years ago, yet nothing has been done. The idea of salvaging the arches was to perhaps do something with the stone in the plaza area(s). He hopes the commission decides to do something with the Northwest and Southeast Plazas. This is part of the Chesapeake TIF and once this is paid off, perhaps the city can do more work in this area. The Old House Guild was hesitant to jump on this idea because they held out hope the Keller Building could be saved and they hoped it will not cost the city an arm and a leg to keep it. Dennis Murray said no further action has been taken by the commission regarding the demolition of the Keller Building. Tim Schwanger asked what the importance of the Curran Street project is and how it fits into the top priority listing. Aaron Klein said he is not familiar with the entire history of how this happened, but can say as far as the storm water, this is in very poor shape and the plans call for a couple of catch basins at the northeast end. There is some work to be done along the street for this. Tim Schwanger said the runoff will go into Sandusky Bay and asked if creating runoff will cause a bigger problem than what already exists. Aaron Klein said the plan is to put in the catch basins and pipe it into the Bay. He has not had conversations about the Erie Soil & Water District to see if they have any recommendations. Tim Schwanger said the runoff from the parking lot at the Paper District Marina does the same thing. This runs into the basin of the marina and he asked why we are not making sure these projects are done alleviating pollution into Sandusky Bay. Aaron Klein said this particular project has Best Management Practices (BMP) installed in the catch basin and this is one of the reasons the city received the Ohio Clean Marina award.

Rudy Ruiz, SFD Fire Marshal, said the department recently completed a strategic plan which recommended presentation of a fire safety message once each month at the commission meetings. The threat of winter fires is real and home fires occur more in winter than any other season. Over 900 people die in winter home fires each year. Over \$2 billion in property loss occurs in winter home fires in the United States. Sixty-seven percent of fires occur in one- and two-family homes and these fires occur between the hours of 5 p.m. – 8 p.m. at any given time throughout the United States. Heating equipment is involved in one of every seven reported home fires and one in every six fire deaths. Rudy Ruiz said anything that could burn should be kept at least three feet away from heating sources (fire places, wood stoves, radiators and space heaters). A qualified professional should inspect chimneys and vents every year. Only one heat-producing appliance, such as a space heater, should be plugged into an electrical outlet at any given time. Smoke alarms and carbon monoxide alarms should be checked on a regular basis and as people stay cozy and warm, they should also be fire smart.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, asked for clarification about the SMA membership as she did not hear a vote. Dennis Murray said there was no motion to vote on this Sharon Johnson asked if Nicole Ard is a board member of SMA and Dennis Murray said Nicole Ard indicated she is not. Sharon Johnson asked if Jeff Smith is a board member and he said he is.

Matt Morgan, 1003 West Osborne Street, expressed his appreciation for the draft parking report as a downtown business owner. As the city moves forward in addressing its budget, we need to take the time and opportunity to recognize a problem and fix it. Matt Morgan said his own business went through change by relocating to another building, but when people understand what is going on and are communicative, this helps ease a lot of concerns. Matt Morgan said tax increases have been discussed, merging services with neighboring agencies, and there is fear of the unknown. Creative new policies and doing things differently will help with this as times are different economically and culturally. Matt Morgan said he is appreciative these topics are coming to light and everyone is coming together to give their two cents. If there is a reason behind something such as a tax increase and the money is going toward something specific, there may be more acceptance. The people downtown would not mind putting in something extra to have a police officer during peak times or using money taken from parking meters for a specific purpose or into an improvement district. People simply need to understand why. The recent county sales tax increase was acceptable when people understood it was going toward necessary infrastructure and was a part-time increase. Business did not diminish because of a slight increase in prices once people understood what it was being used for.

Timothy Work, 517 42<sup>nd</sup> Street, said people would support a tax increase if it is for a definite or specific purpose. The city is at bare bones and is under-staffed and under-funded. He would like to see the city develop a strategic plan. The parking plan is valuable and has a lot of good information, but it must be integrated so it does not sit on a shelf and disappear. There is a lot more to Sandusky than the downtown, which is beautiful. Timothy Work said he would like to see more of the CDBG funds used for increased code enforcement efforts. This would increase revenue and persons who do not keep up their properties would be fined. The revenue could be channeled back into the system. Timothy Work said he has noticed the mayor of Detroit is marketing the city globally and is "open for business" and Sandusky could think about doing the same thing to encourage new small businesses.

**The President announced a recess of the regular session at 7:30 p.m. Three executive sessions were held beginning at 7:35 p.m.**

**The commission returned to open session at 8:58 p.m.**

Dennis Murray said **the city and the commission are going to hit the reset button with their relationship with Nicole Ard.** Some suggestions have been made the commission has not provided sufficient direction and they need to be clear in this regard. Dennis Murray said the commission would like to see the city move forward in a positive direction and with a lot of different inputs, a set of goals and objectives will be provided to Nicole Ard. Dennis Murray said the commission is optimistic they can work together with the city manager. He said the commissioners like working with Nicole Ard personally and he hopes tonight marks an opportunity to set a new tone in the relationship between the commission, as a whole, and the City Manager.

**Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to adjourn. The President announced adjournment at 9 p.m.**

---

Kelly L. Kresser, CMC  
Clerk of the City Commission

---

Dennis E. Murray, Jr.  
President of the City Commission