

Dennis Murray **called the meeting to order** at 5 p.m. after **the Invocation** by Wes Poole, and the **Pledge of Allegiance**.

The clerk called **the roll** and the following Commissioners responded: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady.

City staff present: John Orzech - Police Chief, Dave Degnan – Fire Chief, Aaron Klein – Engineer, Angie Byington – Chief Planner, Matt Lasko – Chief Development Officer, Brad Link – Public Services Director, Don Rumbutis – IT Manager, Don Icsman - Law Director, Hank Solowiej – Finance Director, Eric Wobser – City Manager and Kelly Kresser – Commission Clerk.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Jeff Smith the commission voted to approve the minutes of the January 12, 2015, city commission meeting and suspend the oral reading. The President declared the motion passed.

Dennis Murray **welcomed Eileen Borchardt and students from the Sandusky Area Health Education Center, Ohio Business College**, who are educating themselves about how meetings are run.

Dennis Murray **welcomed members of the Sandusky Tree Commission**.

Dennis Murray introduced **Brad Link, the city's new Director of Public Services**, who will be managing some of the responsibilities previously taken care of by Aaron Klein.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said the proposed sewer and water rate increases are absurd and a 75% hike within three years is too much. There are EPA mandates, but water was running at Hopper's creating a \$500,000 water bill which was never paid; the city has two splash pads running 24/7 all summer flushing thousands of gallons of water down the sewer, and; the city billed Erie County a little over \$641,000 but was never paid because of a lawsuit. Someone needs to make this up and this is the taxpayer.

Vicki Bird, 2114 Wilbert Street, said approximately one third of the city's residents are seniors living on disability and this rate increase may be unaffordable to them. City residents may pay less for water than anyone else, but half of a million dollars has not been restored by the city and people lost their homes. Vicki Bird said she does not see signs to sell this property and perhaps some of this could be recouped if sold rather than raising water rates. Recently, Vicki Bird said she came to the city building to pay for someone's water which had been turned off and they owed approximately \$100; their water was turned off and she was told the city does not discriminate, yet 20 people lose their homes and other customers are now paying for this. Vicki Bird said she is a renter but pays her water bill and the majority of the city is renters and asked if there are plans to be forced to participate in curbside service because of the county. Vicki Bird said she has used Ruffin Refuse for years and likes what they do but has a feeling residents will not be given a choice. If the cost of water is increased, restaurants may start charging to serve water and this is something to start thinking about.

PRESENTATION

Breann Hohman, member of the Sandusky City Tree Commission, said a tree inventory was conducted last year to quantify the condition of street trees in the City of Sandusky to improve management, identify immediate needs and determine what grants are available. This grant was received from the Sandusky Erie County Community Foundation and administered through the Erie Soil & Water Conservation District. The inventory was conducted between May and October, 2014, and data was collected identifying the location, species, size, canopy condition, trunk, sidewalk area and any wires near the trees. The data was compiled using i-Tree software supplied by the USDA Forestry Service. As a result of the survey, data from 6,067 trees was recorded; this does not include trees in public parks or property. The different trees in

Sandusky are considered a \$9 million asset with the majority of trees in the city identified as Maple species. The average trunk size is 12" – 18" in diameter. Using formulas built into the i-Tree software, the average value of trees is \$47 per tree for storm water (trees capture much rainwater which does not get discharged into the system), \$40 per tree in energy, \$5 per tree for carbon sequestration, \$7 per tree for air quality and \$37 per tree for aesthetics. There are 128 trees (less than ten percent) which are dead, and 222 trees (35%) rated in poor condition. More specifically, the city has 233 hollow trees, 338 with bark separation, 530 with girdled roots, 179 with basal shoots and 74 trees with some type of infection. Ninety percent of the trees were rated with fair/good canopies. BreAnn Hohman said 10.8% of the sidewalk areas near street trees have 1" – 3" moderate heaving while one percent have severe heaving identified by 3" or more. There are conflicts with wires or power lines in ten percent of the street trees. Over 50% of the Maple species have some type of pest or disease. Twenty five percent of the trees are considered a high risk (1,500) because of storm damage and could potentially cause infrastructure conflicts. As a result of the tree inventory, it is recommended the city establish a preventative maintenance schedule for trimming, planning and post-planting care. It is also recommended the species diversity be increased as this will help to diversify the urban forest. The city's tree ordinance should be improved so as to define responsibilities of the city and responsibilities of the property owners. There should be an education component to provide outreach to the public. The city spent approximately \$86,000 of staff time in 2014 relating to trees. It is recommended to set aside approximately \$951,550 to get caught up with removals (300 trees), \$562,500 for trimming (1,250 trees), and \$207,600 for planting new trees (approximately 500). It is also recommended to set aside \$262,200 for tree maintenance including \$6,700 for removal (10 trees), \$247,500 for trimming (550 trees) and \$8,000 for planting (20 trees). The City of Sandusky is hosting the 2015 Tree City USA Awards Ceremony on May 12, 2015, recognizing its 25th year as a Tree City. It is also recommended, moving forward, the city define its forestry services, create a management plan, apply for available grants to replant new trees and create an education campaign. BreAnn Hohman thanked the Erie County Community Foundation, the staff and board of supervisors at the Erie County Water Conservation District, Melissa Fetter who performed the tree inventory, members of the Sandusky Tree Commission and city staff, and Mark Wroblewski of the Erie County Auditor's office for their assistance with this project. Wesley Poole asked if the software program could separate information collected into zones and BreAnn Hohman said this is one of the things they would like to be able to utilize as the city moves toward creating an urban forestry management plan. This type of information will start to be done using GIS software, or in the iTree application itself. Wesley Poole said the mission of the Tree Commission is to make recommendations or create a prioritized list for cutting and/or trimming trees. BreAnn said one of the things discussed is to reduce the risk for harm to trees and removal is the largest priority but starting to put off trimming eventually creates a longer list of removals. Wesley Poole said the members of the Tree Commission should tell the commission what needs to be done and this process will go a whole lot faster. Trading off removal for trimming is decided by the city and the city should know which trees should be trimmed or cut first. Eric Wobser recognized Melissa Fetter for all of the hard work she did on this tree inventory and said he is putting the final touches on a budget which does not get into the detail of implementation, but does take into consideration what portion of the new Issue 8 funding could be dedicated to trees. This implementation plan will be worked out and a recommendation will be made with specific ideas in the future. There are benefits for good tree maintenance and some portion of utility dollars could divert water from the storm water system as well.

CURRENT BUSINESS

Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to accept all communications. The President declared the motion passed.

ITEM #1 – Submitted by Aaron Klein, P.E.**AMENDMENT TO PART NINE OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES (WATER REGULATIONS AND RATES)**

Budgetary Information: The purpose of this modification of the Water Regulations and Rates Ordinance is to increase rates to fund capital improvements to the water utility and provide for operation and maintenance costs.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed **amending Part Nine (Streets, Utilities and Public Services Code), Title Three (Utilities), Chapter 939 (Water Regulations and Rates), Section 939.10 (Water Turn-on) and Section 939.13 (City Rates) of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow.**

Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Naomi Twine the commission voted to approve this ordinance at the first reading.

Discussion: Dennis Murray turned the meeting over to Aaron Klein who introduced Tim Warren with Jones & Henry Engineers to discuss the proposed water and sewer rate increases (Item #1 and Item #2) as his company did the majority of the work associated with the increases. Dennis Murray said he is aware this is a very important issue for city residents and these are significant dollars and believes the commissioners may never have thought this type of a rate increase would have fallen under their watch. The city went to the newspaper in advance to provide notice about the increases and are considering this at two meetings to make sure there is as much discussion as possible.

Tim Warren said our water and trees are both very important resources and our lives depend on them. Tim Warren said he also flies and has noticed most of the trees are in cities and there are there is also a hard cost to providing water. During the past 20 years, several rate studies were done, but there have not been water or sewer rate increases since 2003 which makes it harder to present these results. The city recently updated its General Plan to address combined sewer overflows (CSO) into Sandusky Bay and Lake Erie as they contribute to algae problems. As part of this, the city looked at its sewer rates. In previous years, the city undertook rate studies in 2011 and 2013 but recommendations were not implemented at that time. Last year, the city engineer looked at these two studies to determine how to proceed to update them and come up with new recommendations. It was determined to create and use rate spreadsheets to analyze rates on an annual ongoing basis. We are trying to establish rates to keep water and sewer funds in the black and cover expenses; currently we are not in a position to do this. We are deeply into our reserves and we would like to try to establish rates to maintain an adequate reserve. Good financial practice is to maintain a reserve of at least 25% of the operating costs, as well as one year's worth of debt service. The city has been assuming a certain amount of debt to maintain its water systems and there will be additional major improvements required during the next several years. Since our peak revenues in the mid 2000's, we have seen a reduction in revenues on both water and sewer which means usage has declined. These peaked in 2003 which was the last time the city saw a rate increase and this may be attributed to people trying to conserve. We also had a recession during this timeframe and a reduction in population. Sewer revenues have seen a similar decline and one of the revenues are payments made by Erie County toward capital improvement projects. There were major improvement projects at the sewer plant in 2006 and 2010 which Erie County contributed toward. This all translates to an impact on the water and sewer fund balances and fund reserve balances which have declined. If the city goes two more years without doing something, we will have negative fund balances and this is a very serious situation where expenses will exceed revenues. Some of the reasons for the rate increase including it having been 12 years since last increased, inflationary cost increases which include chemical, utility and labor costs, and the decline in consumption. The city is faced with approximately \$12 million in water system improvements and over \$20 million in sewer system improvements during the next seven years to address a variety of issues. Most are related to the algae issues in Sandusky Bay and Lake Erie and most people are familiar with the situation in Toledo last year and they had to shut their water off for a few days which made it very expensive to make water available for residents. Avoiding this type of a crisis will include spending some money to address the problem. Cities across the

country are dealing with this and Sandusky has aging infrastructure, distribution lines going down every street which are 70 – 80 years old, and it has gotten to the point where these aging water lines need to be repaired or replaced more often and are very costly. The city has CSO's which go into Sandusky and make their way into the lake which impacts Lake Erie and there has been a plan in place with the EPA for almost 20 years to address them. The EPA has been taking a harder look at these plans and requiring communities to do more than what was in their plans to further reduce overflows. The first hundred million gallons are a lot less to capture than the last million gallons captured, and the water quality issues to be addressed are very costly. The city has a consent order to do these things and there are fines levied for not doing them. Communities are also faced with new EPA regulations to manage storm water runoff. The drinking water rate model highlights the revenues, expenses, surplus and deficit situation of the fund and the projected actual for 2012 – 2014; this also shows targeted reserves to maintain a sound fund. This information is important as the fund has had a deficit and will continue for the next two years with the rate increases. It will take over two years to get to a break-even point with these increases. The targeted and projected reserves are being adjusted to maintain actual fund balances. The increases needed to meet all of these requirements are 25% in 2015, 25% in 2016 and 7% in 2017 followed by cost of living, inflationary index rates starting in 2018. The city should have regular, very modest increases so it does not find itself in this situation again where such large increases are necessary. The actual rates consist of a minimum charge and a commodity charge. The minimum charge is levied upon the first hundred cubic feet used while the commodity charge is levied upon everything after this. The county has a system of rates established in the agreement and are set every three years; currently this rate is \$1.18/Ccf and the next rate increase is due in 2016 at \$1.62/Ccf. This translates into an actual cost for a user and the average residential customer uses 600 cubic feet of water per month. The EPA uses 1,000 cubic feet of water as a benchmark and surveys water rates throughout the state. Sandusky's rates are low based upon the average water rate on a statewide basis. This does not help decrease the pain associated with the increase right now, but we will still be less than the average after increases. There is a significant amount of debt coming from both the sewer and water funds and it is not good financial policy to borrow every dollar needed for capital improvement. The projected surplus in deficit in the water fund will continue for approximately four years and this is what we are up against. The revenues, expenses and surplus deficits are also projected for the sewer fund; we are trying to maintain a targeted fund balance in approximately 2020. The capital improvement projects are more expensive than improvements with water and this fund needs to be in a position to address this going forward. If we go forward without increases, the sewer fund will have a negative balance in the next two years. The percentage increases on sewer are a little higher than water with three years of 25% increases. Sewer rates are based upon the amount of water used unless customers have a sprinkling meter. The city will also be considering the implementation of a storm water charge within the next two years to hopefully offset some of the new expenses for storm water management with the EPA. These costs need to be more equitably distributed with the customers and may be based upon hard surfaces which contribute more storm water into the system. The County's rate is only a fraction of the city's rate and they pay only for operating costs, not capital costs. They do contribute, up front, for capital improvement projects not included in the rates. These are established via contract and are updated on an annual basis. Communities without CSO's are not looking at making major capital improvements; those with CSO's are having to find a way to pay for improvements and rates are typically higher although Sandusky's have been lower historically. After 2017, it is projected there will be some type of surplus in the deficits to help rebuild our reserves. Sandusky has had the lowest water and sewer rates in the region according to the EPA benchmarks and after the 25% rate increase recommended, Sandusky will still be less than the average in our region. Septic haulers will be charged at a higher rate in addition to higher costs/rates for turning water service on or off.

Dennis Murray thanked Tim Warren and Aaron Klein for putting this information together for tonight's meeting. Over the last two weeks, Dennis Murray said he and the other commissioners have been looking at this information and he has been trying to wrap his head around this as the water fund has been decreasing while the sewer reserves have been going down, but he guessed we needed a rate increase on the order of only 12%. When Aaron Klein

first contacted him around Christmas, Dennis Murray said he got an inkling of the size of the increases recommended and it is stunning. This has been very difficult for the commissioners and staff to accept and obviously is something highly controversial. Dick Brady said he had the opportunity to spend time with Tim Warren and the commissioners to try and educate themselves about this topic and does not need to remind anyone they are elected to be fiscally and financially responsible and this comes with an obligation. Dick Brady said he met with Bill and Bob Waldock who are a significant economic and philanthropic engine for Sandusky and their concern is not so much the amount of the rate increase, but how quickly this seems to have hit us and how unfair it is to turn this into such a high percentage so quickly. As painful as this is, we know it is necessary. It would be easy to blame others, but this serves no good outcome. We have to absorb these numbers, look forward, and put a plan in place to right this ship. The car is in the ditch and the only way to get it out is to tear the band-aid off and do the right thing and he is counting on this community to be able to accept this and move forward. Wes Poole said he has looked at the numbers and listened to the presentation and after listening to what citizens have to say during the next couple of weeks, he will be able to make a decision. The commission cannot change rates slowly to make up for what was not done five or six years ago and we are faced with this. Commissioners change on a regular basis because of term limits and the folks who were here when this first started are no longer and he realizes this is the way the citizens would like the city run and the commissioners will make the decisions in front of them. Dennis Murray said there is nothing to be gained in playing the blame game and he does not know if there is blame to be assigned; this is just the situation we find ourselves in and we will find our way out. Dennis Murray said one of the things he has been asked is if the city can stretch this out for a longer period of time. Tim Warren said we are looking at is a negative fund balance during the next two years if the rates are not increased as outlined. We need to increase the rates by this amount to get back to the positive side of the equation. Dennis Murray said rate increases are driven by demands of the EPA and asked if we can push back to do a little less. Tim Warren said the city is pushing back rather aggressively and has updated its General Plan regarding the CSO's and this is a compromise position from what they would like to see us do and what we say we can afford to do. The city is negotiating as good a plan as it can with the EPA realizing there is pressure from them to do something with the water quality issues. Dennis Murray said they could say this is not enough and Tim Warren said the EPA has typically taken quite a long time with these kinds of negotiations. One thing is certain: the next seven years are very clear and there is no choice but to do them. Beyond the seven year period, the EPA will approve a schedule. Dennis Murrays said the city just put a lot of money into the sewer plant but the EPA has raised the bar and Tim Warren said they want to renegotiate the General Plan through a Consent Order for improvements. The original consent order was issued in 1997 and they are reevaluating and assessing this and have raised the bar. The city has met its original objective of the plan and met the criteria but we are required to further reduce CSO's and it will be very expensive to get to the point they would like us to be and we have presented a compromise. Tim Warren said there were 39 days last year where sanitary sewage flowed into Sandusky Bay along with storm water sewage. Dennis Murray said one of the questions we have heard is there is ongoing litigation with Erie County and over the course of three years, there is approximately \$1 million difference between what the city believes Erie County should have paid versus what they actually paid. This will be reset at the end of the year and there will be a new number and the formula will be followed. Tim Warren said the water fund generates approximately \$6 million in revenue and a ten percent increase would be \$600,000; fifteen percent would generate \$900,000 in one year. Dennis Murray said there has been some talk about the income tax increase and asked Hank Solowiej to explain why this money cannot be used to deal with these deficits. Hank Solowiej said this issue comes up a lot and water funds cannot be used for these types of things as they are considered enterprise funds which means they operate like a business. The city has the ability to set the rates and charge customers for operating a business. They are separate piles of money and funds can only be spent for water or sewer projects and are significantly different. Dennis Murray said this is state law and if water money were spent to purchase a cruiser rather than repairing something at the sewer or water plant, someone could go to jail. Hank Solowiej said this would cause a finding for adjustment and the state would make the city do a journal entry to correct this. Dennis Murray said people are being more conservative with their water and are using more efficient washing machines or shower heads and although it would seem this

would cause a cost savings, it is actually driving some of the price increases. Tim Warren said water increases are directly related to the amount of water people use and as people conserve water, we see a decline in revenue. Obviously this is a two-edged sword as people want to do this to reduce their bill, but this creates a situation where the rates may need to be increased. This is not a unique situation and it is becoming more common as communities are faced with large increases and this tends to create conservation. We try to incorporate this into our models, but it is very difficult to predict. The cost to treat water goes down to a small percent, but a very small amount of our costs are fixed and even when conserving, these costs are not impacted. The only true variable costs are for electric or chemicals and we still have to run the plant and produce water. Dick Brady said it is becoming vividly clear the real key to this is to sell more water and extend the sewer system prudently. Tim Warren said there has been a lot of pressure on past administrators and commissioners and things were not made any easier by the recession which has led to a decline in revenues and it is hard to address this in the middle of one, but it still affects many of us. Julie Farrar thanked Dick Brady and Aaron Klein for spending time with her and helping to understand this information. Our infrastructure is very old, last winter was awful, and city employees were repairing main breaks and helping people in their homes with burst pipes but this needs to be done although painful. On a personal level, Julie Farrar said she likes the idea of paying higher increases the first two years and then having this taper off and after that, prepare. Julie Farrar said she does not want to get to a situation where people come to the podium and ask what happened like it did in Toledo and this way we can be prepared and this is part of Sandusky getting on the right track and we are headed in the right direction.

Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.

ITEM #2 – Submitted by Aaron Klein, P.E.

AMENDMENT TO PART NINE OF THE CODIFIED ORDINANCES (SEWER REGULATIONS AND RATES)

Budgetary Information: The purpose of this modification of the Sewer Regulations and Rates Ordinance is to increase rates to fund improvements associated with the wastewater utility, provide for operation and maintenance costs and meet mandated improvements by the Ohio Environmental Protection Agency.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed **amending Part Nine (Streets, Utilities and Public Services Code), Title Three (Utilities), Chapter 933 (Sewer Regulations and Rates), Sections 933.07 (Definitions), 933.25 (Rates) and 933.28 (Miscellaneous Charges) of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow.**

Upon motion of Scott Schell and second of Julie Farrar, the commission voted to approve this ordinance at first reading. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.

ITEM #3 – Submitted by Amanda Meyers, Paralegal

SALE OF PROPERTY THROUGH THE LAND REUTILIZATION PROGRAM

Budgetary Information: The cost associated with these purchase agreements is the total amount of the title examination, recording and transfer fees, survey and deed preparation. Any such costs shall be recouped by the City from the nonrefundable earnest money deposits required to be paid by Purchasers upon sale. By returning this nonproductive land to tax producing status, the taxing districts will begin collecting real property taxes in the amount of approximately \$103.98 per year.

ORDINANCE NO. 15-009: It is requested an ordinance be passed **declaring that certain real property owned by the city as part of the land reutilization program identified as Parcel #59-01300.000, located at 928 West Madison Street, Sandusky, is no longer needed for any municipal purpose and authorizing the execution of purchase and sale agreements with respect to that real property;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Julie Farrar and second of Naomi Twine the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

ITEM #4 - Submitted by Amanda Meyers, Paralegal

ACCEPTING PROPERTY THROUGH THE LAND REUTILIZATION PROGRAM

Budgetary Impact: There is no cost associated with this property transaction, other than administrative costs associated with taking the time to meet with each of the boards of the taxing districts. The property will remain exempt from taxation.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed **approving that certain real property be retained by the city for devotion to public use as a public parking lot for the Sandusky Transit System.**

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Scott Schell the commission voted to approve this ordinance at the first reading.

Discussion: Dennis Murray said this property is located directly across from the Sandusky Transit System and they are out of parking so it makes sense to use this parcel for additional parking.

Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.

ITEM #5 – Submitted by Dave Degnan, Fire Chief

AUTHORIZATION TO MAKE GRANT APPLICATION FOR PURCHASE OF PATIENT POWER COTS

Budgetary Information: We are seeking \$40,000.00 from the OBWC to purchase the powered cots. The OBWC will fund 75% of the cost for the purchase of the cots up to \$40,000.00. Each power cot costs \$14,650.96. The total cost for four powered cots is \$58,603.84. The remaining balance of \$18,603.84 will be paid with EMS Funds.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested a resolution be passed **authorizing the filing of a grant application to the Ohio Bureau of Workers' Compensation for the safety intervention grant program for the Sandusky Fire Department.**

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Jeff Smith the commission voted to approve this resolution at the first reading.

Discussion: Dave Degnan said this safety grant program is successful and provides up to 75% of \$40,000 to help alleviate workers' compensation claims. The manufacturer is Stryker Power Cot Pros and members of the department, on average, raise and lower patients approximately 7,000 times and in the long-term, there are many lower back injuries which increases medical bills for the city and claims for workers' compensation. These costs allow for lifting up to 700 pounds without assistance and other department's which have utilized these have had great success. Dave Degnan said the city currently has four ambulances and one back-up so we are applying for five cots at a cost to the city (25%) of \$18,603.84.

Roll call on the resolution: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the resolution passed at first reading.

ITEM #6 – Submitted by Dave Degnan, Fire Chief

AUTHORIZATION TO MAKE GRANT APPLICATION FOR PURCHASE OF SCBA TANKS & EQUIPMENT

Budgetary Information: The total cost to purchase the SCBA tanks, tank harnesses and face pieces is \$250,350.00. The grant, if awarded, will cover 90% or \$227,591.00 of the total cost of

the purchase. The City is required to match funding with 10% or \$22,759.00. Upon grant approval, the Fire Department will also be required to pay a \$3000.00 fee to Gatchell Grant Resources, LLC for preparing the grant. This total amount of \$25, 759.00 will be paid with EMS Funds.

RESOLUTION NO. 005-15R: It is requested a resolution be passed **approving and ratifying a grant application submitted to the U.S. Department of Homeland Security, Federal Emergency Management Agency, grant programs directorate for the FY 2014 Assistance to Fire Fighters Grant program and, if awarded, authorizing the city manager to execute any required agreements;** and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Scott Schell and second of Naomi Twine the commission voted to approve this resolution under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Dave Degnan said the current respiratory tanks are ten years old and the NFPA standards allow for two cycles of upgrades and these need to be replaced. Maintenance costs are starting to rise and we will have to replace 90 bottles which cost approximately \$1,000 each. Dave Degnan said he we felt it would be good to apply for this grant to upgrade at this time. This is a ratification as just shortly before the grant deadline, staff determined we could apply for this grant money for this purpose.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the resolution: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the resolution passed.

ITEM #7 – Submitted by Aaron M. Klein, P.E.

EMERGENCY REPAIR WORK AT BIG ISLAND WATER WORKS

Budgetary Information: The cost of the crane rental from All Erection & Crane Rental as quoted for \$2,560.00, and the repair of the screens by Underwater Screening Service as quoted for \$21,646.35. The total to the Water Fund is \$24,206.35.

ORDINANCE NO. 15-010: It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to expend the necessary funds for the emergency repair work to be performed at the Big Island Water Works plant by Underwater Screening Services of Forty-Fort, Pennsylvania, in the amount of \$21,646.35;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Julie Farrar the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Dick Brady said we depend heavily on this product and Aaron Klein said there is one screen at the beginning of the water plant which removes large debris such as zebra mussels through the intake. At the end of the year, employees were doing a routine inspection and noticed some unusual wear. As this is a 40' screen and a few feet into the ground, a majority of it is under water and divers were utilized to look at it. They found there is a chain on both sides and the sprocket was tilted so there are two options. The first is to try resetting the sprocket and risk pulling the chain, or try to fix it and only be out for a day or two as opposed to removing the screen. Aaron Klein said this is the best time of year to get clean water without a lot of debris and turbidity because of the ice cap on top and there are not boats currently stirring up the lake.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

Dennis Murray said next is **a series of nine agreements related to the city's CDBG fund** and monies received through this program are spent through subrecipient agreements with other

entities. This is a paperwork requirement and the commission went through the CDBG plan, a presentation and approval, but this is to formally go through and vote on the contracts.

**ITEM #8 – Submitted by Angela Byington, Director of Neighborhood Development & Planning
SUBRECIPIENT AGREEMENT WITH COMMUNITY ACTION COMMISSION OF ERIE, HURON &
RICHLAND COUNTIES (CACEHR)**

Budgetary Information: The City of Sandusky will award CACEHR a total of \$50,000 for Emergency Home Repair and Accessibility Modifications during the CDBG Program Year FY2014. This award shall be paid from CDBG grant monies and there will be no impact on the General Fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 15-011: It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a subrecipient agreement with the Community Action Commission of Erie, Huron and Richland Counties, Inc., to provide emergency home repair and accessibility modifications and to expend an amount not to exceed \$50,000 from the FY 2014 community development block grant funds;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Wesley Poole and second of Julie Farrar the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

**ITEM #9 – Submitted by Angela Byington, Director of Neighborhood Development & Planning
SUBRECIPIENT AGREEMENT WITH CENTER FOR CULTURAL AWARENESS**

Budgetary Information: The City of Sandusky will award the Center for Cultural Awareness a total of \$21,000 for the Citizens Circle Program for CDBG Program Year FY2014. This award shall be paid from CDBG grant monies and there will be no impact on the General Fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 15-012: It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a subrecipient agreement with the Center for Cultural Awareness to provide a Citizens Circle program and to expend an amount not to exceed \$21,000 from the FY 2014 community development block grant funds;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Julie Farrar and second of Scott Schell the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

ITEM #10 – Submitted by Angela Byington, Director of Neighborhood Development & Planning

SUBRECIPIENT AGREEMENT WITH ERIE COUNTY GENERAL HEALTH DISTRICT

Budgetary Information: The City of Sandusky will award the Erie County General Health District a total of \$8,500 for the 2-1-1 Information and Referral Services for CDBG Program Year FY2014. This award shall be paid from CDBG grant monies and there will be no impact on the General Fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 15-013: It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a subrecipient agreement with the Erie County General Health District to provide a 2-1-1 Information & Referral services program and to expend an amount not to exceed \$8,500 from the FY 2014 community development block grant funds;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Julie Farrar the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call

on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

ITEM #11 – Submitted by Angela Byington, Director of Neighborhood Development & Planning

SUBRECIPIENT AGREEMENT WITH ERIE COUNTY GENERAL HEALTH DISTRICT

Budgetary Information: The City of Sandusky will award the Erie County General Health District a total of \$11,600 for the Community Gardens Program for CDBG Program Year FY2014. This award shall be paid for with CDBG grant monies and there will be no impact on the General Fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 15-014: It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a subrecipient agreement with the Erie County General Health District to provide a community gardening program and to expend an amount not to exceed \$11,600 from the FY 2014 community development block grant funds;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Wesley Poole and second of Naomi Twine the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

ITEM #12 – Submitted by Angela Byington, Director of Neighborhood Development & Planning

SUBRECIPIENT AGREEMENT WITH ERIE COUNTY GENERAL HEALTH DISTRICT

Budgetary Information: The City of Sandusky will award the Erie County General Health District a total of \$10,000 for the Community Wellness Outreach Program for CDBG Program Year FY2014. This award shall be paid from CDBG grant monies and there will be no impact on the General Fund.

ORDINANCE 15-015: It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a subrecipient agreement with the Erie County General Health District to provide a community wellness outreach program and to expend an amount not to exceed \$10,000 from the FY 2014 community development block grant funds;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Julie Farrar and second of Scott Schell the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

ITEM #13 – Submitted by Amanda Byington, Director of Neighborhood Development & Planning

SUBRECIPIENT AGREEMENT WITH SUCCESSFUL RELATIONSHIPS, INC.

Budgetary Information: The City of Sandusky will award Successful Relationships, Inc. a total of \$14,000 for the Train up a Child, Group Mentoring Program and Summer Fun Day Camp for CDBG Program Year FY2014. This award shall be paid from CDBG grant monies and there will be no impact on the General Fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 15-016: It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a subrecipient agreement with Successful Relationships, Inc., to provide a train up a child mentoring project and a summer fun day camp and to expend funds in an amount not to exceed \$14,000 from the FY 2014 community development block grant;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Wesley Poole and second of Jeff Smith the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi

Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

ITEM #14 – Submitted by Angela Byington, Director of Neighborhood Development & Planning

SUBRECIPIENT AGREEMENT WITH VOLUNTEERS OF AMERICA

Budgetary Information: The City of Sandusky will award the Volunteers of America a total of \$60,000 for the Help Against Homelessness VII Program for CDBG Program Year FY2014. This award shall be paid from CDBG grant monies and there will be no impact on the General Fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 15-017: It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a subrecipient agreement with the Volunteers of America of Greater Ohio to provide the help against homelessness program and to expend an amount not to exceed \$60,000 from the FY 2014 community development block grant funds;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Scott Schell and second of Jeff Smith the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

ITEM #15 – Submitted by Angela Byington, Director of Neighborhood Development & Planning

SUBRECIPIENT AGREEMENT WITH WSOS COMMUNITY ACTION COMMISSION, INC.

Budgetary Information: The City of Sandusky will award WSOS Community Action Commission, Inc. a total of \$5,369 for Down Payment Assistance/Homebuyer Education Program for CDBG Program Year FY2014. This award shall be paid from CDBG grant monies and there will be no impact on the General Fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 15-018: It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a subrecipient agreement with WSOS Community Action Commission, Inc. to provide for down payment assistance and homebuyer education and to expend funds in an amount not to exceed \$5,369 from the FY 2014 community development block grant;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Julie Farrar and second of Wesley Poole the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

ITEM #16 – Submitted by Angela Byington, Director of Neighborhood Development & Planning

SUBRECIPIENT AGREEMENT WITH WSOS COMMUNITY ACTION COMMISSION, INC.

Budgetary Information: The City of Sandusky will award WSOS Community Action Commission, Inc. a total of \$50,000 for the Housing Repair Program for CDBG Program Year FY2014. This award shall be paid from CDBG grant monies and there will be no impact on the General Fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 15-019: It is requested an ordinance be passed **authorizing and directing the city manager to enter into a subrecipient agreement with WSOS Community Action Commission, Inc. to provide for a housing repair program and to expend funds in an amount not to exceed \$50,000 from the FY 2014 community development block grant;** and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Wesley Poole the commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed.

CITY MANAGER'S REPORT

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$100 from 95.3 WLKR/K96 for the Firefighter's Chili Cook-off. The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$78 from St. Stephen's Church Generation Group for the K-9 Fund. The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Scott Schell and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$20 from Larry and Loretta Koepp for the Friends of the Greenhouse. The President declared the motion passed.

Eric Wobser asked Aaron Klein to provide an **update about the water meter replacement project**. Aaron Klein said over 700 water meters were replaced south of the tracks on the east end of the city as well as at Cedar Point and Sandusky High School. We are looking at getting a couple of months of data to see if the city can get a return on investment and proceed with replacing a larger amount of meters.

Eric Wobser said the **police department will host a forum on January 29 at 5:30 p.m. to educate the public about what they should do when stopped by the police**. This is being presented by the Toledo Chapter of the Buffalo Soldier's Motorcycle Club in the Royal Palm Room at the Quality Inn and Lodge and the public is welcome and encouraged to attend. Eric Wobser said this is one of a series of steps being taken by the police department to build community relationships and educational opportunities on how to react to officers. John Orzech said this will be livestreamed on the [Sandusky Register](#) website and is another opportunity for people to view the presentation.

Eric Wobser said last year the commission passed legislation regarding **donation boxes and also vacant/foreclosed property registration** to eliminate blight in the community as it relates to housing. These registrations are now up and running and there were concerns about implementing this, but Matt Lasko has done a great deal of working with the Finance and Law Departments to get this ready. Dennis Murray asked if this information will be added to the city's website and Eric Wobser said he has asked information to be distributed by each department to update the website. We hope to do a lot more of this and get information updated on the city's website. There are forms in place and being used by the departments. Matt Lasko said as part of this legislation there is a \$10,000 maintenance bond required in addition to the registration form. Mortgaging companies and servicing agencies are being referred to the Code Enforcement Division to fill out the appropriate forms including the bond form. Banks, mortgage companies and loan servicers are looking proactively at cities and municipalities to see if these forms are online because these types of ordinances are becoming more and more common at the municipal level. Dennis Murray asked if there will be an organized campaign letting them know this legislation is in effect and Matt Lasko said the expectation is compliance starts immediately, but we need to reach out to some of the large companies and proactively market to them. Some of the larger national agencies have people on staff who have contacted us but we need to reach some of the other level companies to let them know of this requirement.

Eric Wobser said Angela Byington led the search for a **new Transit Director** and thinks we have found the right candidate. The city has made an offer to **Marvin Randelson** who will start with the city on February 17. He is currently employed by Bike Cleveland which is a biking advocacy organization in Cleveland, has been educated as a planner and has a great understanding of transit. Eric Wobser said we were very honest about the current condition of our transit department from a financial and operational perspective and Marvin was very excited by this

challenge and we are excited to have him. Eric Wobser said Marvin grew up in Cleveland with a family who did not have access to an automobile until his late 20's and has a perspective from a family who had to utilize transit services. Eric Wobser said Aaron Klein and Hank Solowiej's staff who have been overseeing a difficult transition within the Sandusky Transit System since the departure of the previous director and thanked Sally Poggiali and Megan Stookey in particular for their invaluable assistance. Aaron Klein said Megan Stookey is one of those employees who does not always get enough credit but is a workhorse and is an amazing part of Aaron Klein's team.

Eric Wobser said the **Public Services Department and Recreation offices** relocated over the weekend to the city service center on Cement Avenue. We are utilizing these empty offices and he is very excited for this transition and looking forward to what Brad Link will be doing to keep these departments up and running.

OLD BUSINESS

Dennis Murray said he does not wish to be part of **county-wide hauling** and said if the city does this we will end up subsidizing the county. There are things which make it more expensive to live in the city and things which make it less expensive to live in the city. The city's density and ability to deliver services make some things less expensive and we have asked the county to be part of a bid, without obligation, to participate in hauling. This will have an option which will show what this will look like only for the City of Sandusky, all of Erie County, and all of Erie County less Sandusky for comparison purposes to implicitly get at a number. Dennis Murray said he understands this needs to be done to get to a number and does not necessarily like this but the county is in the driver's seat and they say they can force us into county-wide collection, but we will see how the numbers come in.

NEW BUSINESS

Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Jeff Smith, the commission voted to hold an executive session regarding pending litigation, water. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Julie Farrar, Scott Schell, Jeff Smith, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wesley Poole and Dick Brady. The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Jeff Smith and second of Julie Farrar, the commission voted to hold a Public Hearing regarding the 2015 budget on February 9 at 5 p.m. The President declared the motion passed.

Dennis Murray said there is an upcoming **Charter Review process** and asked the commissioners to make their two appointments to this Committee. Julie Farrar appointed Pervis Brown, former city commissioner and Talon Flohr, a SHS alumni who is currently a student at The Ohio State University obtaining a degree in Political Science. Scott Schell appointed Chris Parthemore who is active in North Coast Young Professionals and Mike Will, former City Manager and currently running his own local business. Jeff Smith appointed Darwitt Garrett, a local activist and Ohio State University graduate who served on the last review committee and former Fire Chief Mike Meinzer. Dennis Murray appointed Dan Kaman, former city commissioner and Christine Mack with Firelands Regional Medical Center Foundation. Naomi Twine appointed Jennifer Washington, long-time resident and volunteer and Donovan Cole, a student at Firelands-BGSU and SHS graduate. Wes Poole appointed Anthony Jones who serves on the Revolving Loan Fund Committee and Dennis Feltner who previously served on the Planning Commission and currently on the Downtown Parking Committee. Dick Brady appointed Andy Gundlach who is a graduate of Ohio University and is a fifth generation employee of Gundlach Sheet Metal Works in Sandusky and Nikki Lloyd who graduated from Ohio Northern University's School of Pharmacy and owns the Green Door Mediaworks and Volstead Bar. Dennis Murray thanked the commissioners for their thought and said he thinks this will be a good group to provide us with ideas. Dennis Murray asked Kelly Kresser to get in touch with these people so they can set an initial meeting and get together to do their work.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, asked if the results of the survey regarding our housing stock has been received and Eric Wobser said the report from the Thriving Communities Institute has been completed and turned over to the city. Eric Wobser said this will be presented at a future commission meeting to be formally presented. The timing of this comprehensive look at our housing stock along with our trees gives us a great snapshot of the conditions of the city and will help to complete the comprehensive plan and strategic plan. This is the best baseline of the city's infrastructure we have ever had. Sharon Johnson said she has heard a lot about county-wide recycling and if the city goes with this, she is concerned as we signed a five-year contract with FSI for the recycle bins. Dennis Murray said we are not so sure the county can make us do this and we will have to see how this turns out.

Darwitt Garrett, 313 Tiffin Avenue, thanked Jeff Smith for putting him on the Charter Review Committee.

Nark Norman, 1016 Third Street, said this has been an amazing year and was frustrated the city was floundering in every area, but he has seen the commission systematically rebuild the staff we can have a great deal of confidence in, and they are addressing every issue.

Sandra White, representing Successful Relationships, said they held summer camps last year and the money provided by the city paid for wages for the counselors. Forty to fifty children per day were serviced from 9:30 a.m. – 3 p.m. and had tutoring programs, bible study, physical education and free time. They worked with social skills for the children ages 4 – 14 and thanked the commission for approving this. The mentoring program will continue all year for children who live in the city.

Timothy Work, 517 42nd, said he would like to give credit to the city staff as he is encouraged by seeing Sandusky head in the direction of making this a better place. It is important to turn the tide around and trees are important as they create beauty.

The President announced a recess of the regular session at 7:20 p.m. At 7:25 p.m., the commission went into executive session. At 7:39 p.m., the President announced adjournment of the meeting.

Kelly L. Kresser, CMC
Clerk of the City Commission

Dennis E. Murray, Jr.
President of the City Commission