

President Craig Stahl called the meeting to order at 5:08 p.m. and opened with the **Invocation**, given by Craig Stahl, followed by the **Pledge of Allegiance**.

Upon motion of Bob Warner and second of Pervis Brown, the City Commissioners voted to excuse Brett Fuqua from this meeting. The Clerk called the roll and the following Commissioners responded: Yeas: Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 6.

Craig Stahl said many ideas have been brought to the attention of the City Commissioners about tonight's meeting. He said he would like to listen to the government officials, haulers and citizens in attendance to assist the City Commission to provide the City Manager with recommendations for a course of action regarding yard waste, recycling and refuse collection because of recycling changes which will become effective in June, 2010. Craig Stahl said his family has a 50-year relationship with Canfield Hartley and he wanted to be certain that no one had a problem in continuing his role tonight. There being no dissent, the meeting proceeded.

Dave Waddington said he discussed the bid process with Don Icsman and that because the bid requirement for a \$1,500 bid bond or certified check was removed from the specifications, the bids should be considered null and void and we should start the process over. Don Icsman said this was correct and the main reason he suggested the City Commissioners formally move to reject all of these bids at their last meeting.

Craig Stahl then read a memorandum prepared by Matt Kline about trash and recycling. The memorandum said the Commissioners have made it clear the city should not have a single hauler for everything. His memo stated haulers are required to offer curbside recycling and residents can contact their hauler to sign up for this service rather than making it mandatory as this would cost citizens more money. Matt Kline's memorandum also stated the city could pick up the cost of the recycling bins as an alternative.

Dave Waddington said he saw several problems needing to be addressed and one or two City Commissioners need to get on these as soon as possible. He said we should do one sweep for leaf collection, rather than two, later in the year. Dave Waddington said the recycle bins in Sandusky will be in place through the end of the year and after this, only the ones at the county facility will be available. These are being streamlined because the county did not receive the ODNR grant funding in May. He said the haulers may have to consider alternative options for recycling. Dave Waddington said he has used Ruffin Refuse for years and he does not want to put them out of business. He said he heard on the radio the city could save money by using one hauler, but the City Commissioners have not voted on anything and said the bids were part of the blame and that there are a lot of rental units in Sandusky. Dave Waddington said this is frustrating and we need some direction for recycling and a place for local haulers to store and take recyclables to as they cannot all afford to take them to Oberlin. Residents could then opt-in or opt-out for recycling services with their individual hauler. Craig Stahl said these are some great points and he, too, did not want to do away with any local haulers.

Dave Waddington said there were meetings back in March to make modifications to our original Ordinance to address changes in recycling like computer waste. He said he received information tonight for the first time about the bids received and he asked if anyone knew if the frequency for the bids from Allied and FSI (bi-monthly or weekly?). He said we need to go through our Ordinance and re-compose it according to the EPA guidelines. He said we are required to **offer** recycling services, not mandate them. Julie Farrar said smaller companies cannot afford the cost for a recyclables dumpster and this is a hurdle. She said recycling should be an option, but not mandatory, as some people will choose not to recycle. She said this does need to be addressed by the smaller companies and they should either come together to get one bin or the city should get one and have the haulers pay a fee for its use. She also said she is not for putting companies out of business.

Dave Waddington said our Ordinance modifications may require haulers to have trash compactors and may not allow for tarps on pickup trucks. He said this may end up eliminating some haulers, but we cannot have trash bouncing around on our streets. He asked how haulers are licensed and Don Icsman said the Erie County Health Department performs this task. Don Icsman said the city used to be more involved with the inspections but the county now inspects and licenses. A service provider agreement is then executed for hauling to the landfill. He said the city's current Ordinance does require haulers to offer recycle services although this aspect of the law has not been enforced and his preference would be to throw this out and get direction for alternatives. He believes our Ordinance should be revised to allow for minimal regulations like some of the samples from other cities. Dave Waddington said this is

to keep solid waste out of our landfills and asked Craig Stahl his thoughts about forming a committee to go back to the original Ordinance and make changes. Craig Stahl said he would accept a motion to support forming this committee to look at our 19 hauler system, voluntary participation for recycling and reworking our current Ordinance by the end of the year. He suggested members include two City Commissioners, two haulers, two citizens and one county representative for a seven person committee.

Dave Waddington then asked what our plan was for leaf collection as the leaves are now falling and we need to get moving. He suggested we do one sweep of the city for leaf collection to save time and money. He said we also have an offer from Barnes Nursery allowing residents the option to take their leaves to Barnes at no charge.

Upon motion of Julie Farrar and second of Pervis Brown, the City Commissioners voted to support our 19 haulers, to rework the city's Ordinance offering voluntary recycling for passage by the end of the year, and to form a committee made up of two City Commissioners, two staff members, one county representatives and two citizens.

Discussion: Pervis Brown asked for clarification that we were talking only about refuse in this motion and Craig Stahl indicated we were. Dan Kaman asked if this means the committee already established would be defunct. Craig Stahl said Pervis Brown and Bob Warner could continue to serve on this committee as the City Commission's representative and other city representatives could include Don Icsman and Matt Kline. Dan Kaman said the root cause of the mess we are in is the county - and recycling. He said recycling is the problem which needs to be addressed and this somehow has morphed into trash, refuse hauling and leaves. The committees are good but we need to figure out what are we doing with recycling then move on to leaves and trash, if necessary. He said he hears the street sweeper and leaf machine are not working yet he has passed the street sweeper a number of times since we've said this. Dan Kaman said the real problem is the county landfill being too big for what we need and the fact that we are recycling more than what we should be. He said it must come back to the county and they are all here tonight and we should hear from them and what their plan is. If there is to be a county-wide program, he is probably going to have to be for it but does not understand why they were just coming to the city to remove recycle bins but not others in the county. Dan Kaman said these problems need to be solved one step at a time, first recycling, then leaves and then go back to the trash. He believes this Commission needs to give direction to Matt Kline to handle recycling first, then leaves and then trash. Craig Stahl said this gives us an end and leaves must be handled separately for this year. He would like to make recycling available in the city and give direction for the other issues.

Bob Warner said the intent was to get the current haulers to offer recycling as this was not happening before these meetings started taking place. He said the haulers are advertising they offer this service at a fair cost and citizens can call on a voluntary basis to sign up for curbside recycling. Craig Stahl said he felt this service needs to be structured and Bob Warner said our Ordinance states recycling must be offered and the leaf collection is an immediate issue. Craig Stahl said forming the committee is a good compromise to clean up our legislation.

Vote on the motion: Yeas: Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 6.

Lisa Beurksen, District Coordinator for the Erie County Solid Waste District, said the city will need to provide a tonnage estimate for the recycling program being offered. She said some haulers are just getting started and do not yet have a lot of tonnage. Pat Shenigo, Erie County Commissioner, said the county will need to adopt a plan and will need these numbers. Jack Myers, Erie County Sanitary Engineer, said the EPA must first approve and accept this plan. If the bins are removed and the registered haulers are going to begin picking up recyclables, they must meet the requirements of the State plan. He said the county will need to meet with them (EPA) first and ask these questions. He had thought the city decided to go to a single hauler system or use five different haulers, one per zone, but this new direction would need to first be approved by the EPA. He said the county is operating under a 10-year plan which is updated every five years and they will need to keep track of the tonnage as this will come up again in five years. Jack Myers said cities across the U.S. are going with curbside recycling programs and haulers should be working toward bidding this service. He said haulers will have to store recyclables until they have enough to make a trip and by working together, they could be successful. Jack Myers said it is a tough political decision to put people out of business but someday it will happen as the nation is heading this way and we should all work together.

Dave Waddington said the year 2015 is the year the county is supposed to have 50% of the city's population recycling and Lisa Beurksen said this is why they were working toward removing the drop-off locations in areas where it is feasible to go to curbside recycling. A member of the audience asked if the requirements would be met by removing the recycle bins and haulers individually offered a voluntary curbside recycling program. Lisa Beurksen said "yes", but indicated this would give the county fewer points than if it were all contracted out with one hauler. She said the point system is the Ohio EPA's performance measurement and if the residents have no choice but to recycle, they are at 100%; if they have a choice/option whether or not to recycle, it is only partial or 25%. Ninety percent of the population must be met.

Pat Shenigo said the county needs to run their landfill which has requirements to be met through the Solid Waste District component and a solution should be provided that works for everybody. He said they are not trying to put 19 haulers out of business. Julie Farrar said she understood the points, but with the 19 hauler system, we are never going to get more than 25%. Jack Myers said we should be working toward a goal of improving this in the next five years.

Bob Warner said this is the county's baby and the city is trying to help and do the best we can. He said if the county wants to mandate everyone have curbside recycling, they should do this. If they mandate something different, maybe they could consider an extra surcharge on property taxes to help pay for it. The city can offer voluntary recycling but he said he does not think we are going to get anything better. Jack Myers said the county cannot mandate this and this may be a legal issue to consider. Craig Stahl said this is a good compromise for now. Dave Waddington said the smaller haulers need a place to take recyclables as they cannot each afford to purchase equipment to handle recyclables and maybe three or four of them could work together.

Tom Ferrell, Erie County Commissioner, said the county will support whatever the city decides. He said the mandate is from the EPA and the county is ready to move forward and see how this will work. He said they had no interest in putting anyone out of business. Bill Monaghan, Erie County Commissioner, reiterated the county is not trying to put anyone out of business but are mandated by EPA goals and have a \$30 million debt at the landfill they are trying to get under control which belongs to everyone in the county. He said the recycle containers can remain in Sandusky, but the county cannot continue paying for all of them. Bill Monaghan said the city is running out of cash just like the county and this committee should get together to help solve these problems.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington, the Commissioners voted to do one sweep for leaf collection and to do this later in the season while also providing the option for residents to take their leaves to Barnes for free. This motion was seconded by Bob Warner.

Discussion: Bob Warner asked about the costs involved. Ed Widman said the city pays Barnes \$1,500 regardless of the amount of leaves so this is a fixed cost. He said Scott Miller, Director of General Services, estimates city employees spend over 2,600 hours picking up leaves which is more time than they spend patching streets and plowing snow or salting roads. He said labor costs alone could be reduced by \$50,000 by performing only one sweep for leaves which is time and money that could be spent performing other tasks. This estimated savings only includes fixed costs. Ed Widman said the vacuum device the city uses is currently broken and the auger used to discharge leaves into another truck is junk. Dave Waddington said he believes the \$50,000 in savings cuts our costs by more than half and we should give consideration to bidding this process out next year. He said the city gets a lot of calls about leaves once they get covered by snow up. Craig Stahl said if we are to perform only one sweep, residents need to understand that when we are done, we are done. Dave Waddington said performing sweeps earlier are ineffective and we need to make changes to survive. Craig Stahl said he wanted to give fair warning this may cause gutters to clog and to be ready for this problem next year. Dave Waddington said we now use beet juice on our streets rather than salt and it is going to be snowing soon and he has not heard anything about this yet for the upcoming season. He said we cannot wait until a problem happens to make a decision.

Dan Kaman said leaves are going to be a problem until we get them picked up. He said bagging leaves was not going to work and he was glad we were not doing this now. He said leaves are already out at the curbs and on the streets and with the recent rains, there is flooding at intersections as residents had been expected to bag their leaves. Dave Waddington stated Sandusky is different from Huron with our large number of rental units and we should handle this differently. Pervis Brown said he is in favor of performing one pickup and was disgusted with requiring residents to bag their leaves because of the age of our citizens. He said work is not forced upon kids now like it was when he was young. Pervis Brown

said we need to plan and look into the future to replace our equipment next year as we cannot continue to hobble along. He said the City Manager should be directed to start looking for solutions to take care of this for next year. Dan Kaman said there needs to be documentation from the staff about breakdowns and necessary replacement(s) rather than waiting until November to see what we are going to do. He said we do this for the purchase of ambulances and police cars and that if our equipment is not making it, it needs to be documented and submitted to the City Commissioners. Julie Farrar asked the county officials if they had a leaf machine we could borrow, but they indicated they do not pick up leaves.

Vote on the motion: Yeas: Pervis Brown, Bob Warner, Dave Waddington, Dan Kaman, Julie Farrar and Craig Stahl, 6.

Craig Stahl then invited those present to the microphone for Audience Participation.

A motion was made by Dan Kaman and seconded by Bob Warner to adjourn the special meeting. Craig Stahl announced the special session was adjourned at 5:59 p.m.

Kelly L. Kresser
Interim Clerk of the City Commission

Craig H. Stahl
President of the City Commission